

**SOUTHERN WEST VIRGINIA COMMUNITY AND TECHNICAL COLLEGE
BOARD OF GOVERNORS
MEETING OF APRIL 16, 2013**

ITEM: Academic Program Review

RECOMMENDED RESOLUTION: *RESOLVED*, That Southern West Virginia Community and Technical College Board of Governors approve the discontinuance of the Dental Hygiene, Associate in Applied Science degree program in accordance with the provisions of the West Virginia Council for Community and Technical College Education, Title 135 Procedural Rule, Series 10, Policy Regarding Program Review.

STAFF MEMBER: Dr. Lisa Haddox-Heston

RATIONALE FOR THE RECOMMENDATION:

In accordance with West Virginia Code and Council Policy Series 10, *Policy Regarding Program Review*, the Department of Allied Health and Nursing conducted a program review of the Associate in Applied Science Dental Hygiene program during the 2012-2013 academic year.

It is recommended that the dental hygiene program be discontinued due to the financial burden on the college and that the current class (which is scheduled to graduate in 2014), be the last class admitted to the program.

PROGRAM REVIEW
Southern West Virginia Community and Technical College
Board of Governors

Program with Special Accreditation Program without Specialized Accreditation

Program: Dental Hygiene, Associate in Applied Science April 16, 2013
Degree and Title Date

INSTITUTIONAL RECOMMENDATION

The institution is obligated to recommend continuance or discontinuance for each program reviewed and provide a brief rationale for its recommendation.

- 1. Continuation of the program at the current level of activity without corrective action;
- 2. Continuation of program with corrective action (specify required action - e.g., reducing the range of optional tracks or other corrective action);
- 3. Identification of the program for further development;
- 4. Development of a cooperative program with another institution or sharing of courses, facilities, and/or faculty, and the like;
- X 5. Discontinuance of the program in accordance with provisions of the West Virginia Council for Community and Technical College Education, Title 135, Procedural Rule, Series 11, *Degree Designation, General Education Requirements, New Program Approval, and Discontinuance of Existing Programs.*

Rationale for Recommendation:

It is recommended that the program be discontinued due to the financial burden on the college. The current class, which is scheduled to graduate in 2014, will be the last class admitted to the program.

<u>Lisa Jan Haddock - Horton</u>	<u>4/11/13</u>
Signature of person preparing report if other than Department Chair	Date
<u>Alyson Dean</u>	<u>4/11/13</u>
Signature of Department Chair	Date
<u>Amelia L Alderman</u>	<u>4/11/13</u>
Signature of Dean	Date
<u>Harry Langley, Jr.</u>	<u>4/11/13</u>
Signature of Vice President for Academic Affairs	Date
_____ Signature of President	_____ Date
_____ Signature of Chair, Board of Governors	_____ Date

PROGRAM REVIEW

For Occupational Programs

Implemented Under the Provisional of Series 37

West Virginia Council for Community and Technical College Education

Institution: Southern West Virginia Community and Technical College

Program: Dental Hygiene, Associate in Applied Science

April 16, 2013

PROGRAM REVIEW
Southern West Virginia Community and Technical College
Programs WITH Specialized Accreditation

Summary of Findings
2012-2013

Program Name: Dental Hygiene, Associate in Applied Science

Hours Required for Graduation: 60

I. Synopses of significant findings, including findings of external reviewer(s)

A. Adequacy

- The curriculum has adequate requirements that meet the needs of the industry.
- The program has established goals and objectives.
- The program provides skilled job pathways.
- Entrance requirements exceed community college entrance standards.
- The program has appropriately trained faculty.
- The program maintains appropriate assessment tools.

Conclusion: The program meets or exceeds minimum adequacy requirements.

B. Viability

- The program has maximum enrollment with each class.
- Graduates are within expectations for the program.
- History of program indicates an increase in interested potential applicants.
- The program is an associate in applied science program.

Conclusion: The program meets minimum viability requirements.

C. Necessity

- The program meets a validated industry demand.
- The graduates are successfully and gainfully employed.

Conclusion: The program meets minimum requirements for necessity.

D. Consistency with Mission

- The program supports the mission and vision of the institution.
- The program and core courses support the compact.
- There is limited impact on other programs.

Conclusion: The program is consistent with the mission of the college.

II. Plans for program improvement, including timeline.

While the program has many strengths, one of the major weaknesses is the lack of clinical facilities and the necessity to rent space from Logan Regional Medical Center at their Life Services Center. At the November 30, 2012 Curriculum and Instruction Committee meeting it was discussed that there would be space available in the new building being constructed on the Williamson Campus. This has yet to be evaluated. If space is not available for the clinic, it has been recommended that the program be discontinued due to the financial burden on the college and that the current class (which is scheduled to graduate in 2014), be the last class admitted to the program.

III. Identification of weaknesses or deficiencies from the previous review and the status of improvements implemented or accomplished.

This is the initial program review for the Dental Hygiene program.

IV. Five year data trend on graduates and majors enrolled.

The program continues to attract students in the underserved areas of Southern West Virginia and Eastern Kentucky, as well as from out of state and the international community. The class that is currently enrolled includes two students who relocated to attend Southern and this program. Additionally, the program has had several inquiries from international students. While Southern West Virginia and Eastern Kentucky are recognized as underserved areas at the Federal level in dental providers, the Bureau of Labor Statistics lists Dental Hygiene as having a 38% growth rate between 2010 and 2020. This is a much higher than average growth rate for comparable professions. The median annual salary for dental hygienists is \$68,250 per year and \$32.81 per hour. The Bureau of Labor Statistics is projecting an additional 68,500 dental hygienists will graduate between 2010 and 2020. It should also be noted that this program has fostered a desire for advanced degrees in at least two former students. One graduate is currently attending West Virginia University School of Dentistry, while one recently took the Dental Aptitude Test and scored well above the national average. It is his intent to attend dental school beginning in the fall of 2014 and return to this geographic area to practice.

Dr. Harry Langley, VP for Academic Affairs and Student Services, met with Dr. Pamela L. Alderman, Dean for Career and Technical Programs, Dr. Lisa Haddox-Heston, Coordinator for Dental Hygiene and Alyce Diaz, Chair for Allied Health and Nursing, in the fall semester, 2012. Concerns about the program, equipment, curriculum, and upcoming accreditation visit for April, 2014 were discussed. The equipment is outdated and there is a scarcity of jobs in the immediate area. The annual operating budget is less than \$15,000 and the college rents for the dental hygiene clinic at \$25,000.00 per year.

Knowledge of available space on the Williamson Campus, which would eliminate the \$25,000 per year rent and the plans for the college to accept international students, was not apparent at the time of this meeting last semester.

Bridgmont Community and Technical College was in receipt of a grant several years ago that stipulated that enrollment into their dental hygiene program be increased over a period of three years. Approximately thirty-five students per year were accepted. This in turn did flood the market in the Kanawha Valley.

According to CareerBuilder and Economic Modeling Specialists (EMSI) on February 14, 2013, it was reported that dental hygienists are among the top ten paying jobs requiring an associate's degree in the U.S. The study utilized EMSI's extensive labor market database. This incorporated more than ninety U.S. and state employment resources and included detailed information on employees and self-employed workers. The list below was compiled for projected 2013 salaries, dental hygienists ranked number three.

1. Air Traffic Controller: \$113,547 (median salary)
2. Radiation Therapist: \$76,627
3. Dental Hygienist: \$70,408
4. Nuclear Medicine Technologist: \$69,638
5. Nuclear Technician: \$68,037
6. Registered Nurse: \$65,853
7. Diagnostic Medical Sonographer: \$65,499
8. Fashion Designer: \$63,170
9. Aerospace Engineering and Operations Technician: \$61,547
10. Engineering Technician (except drafters): \$58,698

According to one estimate, Benco Dental, a company that deals with operatories, not a manufacturer with institutional discounts, the cost for ten operatories was quoted at \$135,000. The estimate does not include imaging (radiography) and equipment. An estimate of these costs is not currently available.

The dental hygiene clinic provides an invaluable community service. Oral prophylaxis, intraoral radiographs, pit and fissure sealants, fluoride treatments, and other preventive and diagnostic services are provided free of charge. Dental Hygiene students have provided dental exams at Headstart of P.R.I.D.E. and have worked with the Day Report Center. There are greater than 750 patients of record at the dental hygiene clinic.

V. Summary of assessment model and how results are used for program improvement.

Students enrolled in associate degree programs are expected to participate in institutional, programmatic, course and/or service assessment activities. This participation will most often be in the form of tests to determine the degree of student academic achievement within the basic skills, the general education core curriculum, or the academic major.

Minimum standard goals have been identified and the faculty work to ensure the goals of the Dental Hygiene program are achieved upon completion of the two-year program. The goals include preparing the students to function and interact as Dental Hygienists, as well

as gain successful employment in their chosen field. These programmatic goals cover the three learning domains necessary for the Dental Hygiene student. These domains include the cognitive, psychomotor, and affective learning domains.

VI. Data on student placement

Students and employers are asked to complete surveys after six months of employment. Unfortunately, this is completely voluntary on the part of the graduate and employer; thus, the data is incomplete. From the data available at this time, approximately 70% of graduates are employed as dental hygienists in this geographic area.

PROGRAM REVIEW
Southern West Virginia Community and Technical College
2012-2013
Program With Specialized Accreditation

Program: Dental Hygiene, Associate in Applied Science

I. Program Description

The Dental Hygiene Program at Southern West Virginia Community and Technical College prepares the student to examine, assess, and treat dental patients using a variety of diagnostic and treatment modalities. Dental Hygienists are invaluable members of the dental team in providing comprehensive dental care for their patients. Employment opportunities include private practice, education, and county, state, and federal agencies. Dental Hygiene is a highly compensated and rewarding career. Flexible working hours are common, and with the implementation of expanded duties, the demand for hygienists is high and continues to grow nationwide.

II. Special Accreditation Information

The Dental Hygiene Program is accredited by the Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA). The program underwent an intensive self-study and was granted the status of **INITIAL ACCREDITATION** following a site evaluation in 2005. A second site evaluation took place once the program was fully operational in 2007. The program was granted the status of **APPROVAL (without reporting requirements)**, an accreditation status granted to an educational program indicating that the program achieves or exceeds the basic requirements for accreditation. The next site evaluation for the program is scheduled for April, 2014.

III. Program Statement of Adequacy, Viability, Necessity and Consistency with College Mission

Adequacy

The overall adequacy of the program including the curriculum and facilities was found to achieve or exceed the standards set forth by the Commission on Dental Accreditation, in 2007. Due to the Title III grant, the technology availability in the classroom has been greatly expanded. Effective July 15, 2011 the West Virginia Community and Technical College System (WVCTCS) adopted rule 135-11-3, which in part states that associate degrees shall not exceed 60 credit hours unless specified by an accrediting agency. Accordingly, the curriculum was reduced from 72 credit hours to 60 credit hours, taking into account the requirements of the WVCTCS for general education hours and the Commission on Dental Accreditation educational standards. CODA considers this to be a major change; accordingly, a report was sent to CODA and this was an agenda item considered at their February 1, 2013, meeting. The letter addressing this matter is provided in Appendix I.

A. Curriculum

CODA is very specific regarding the educational requirements for an accredited dental hygiene program. The curriculum *must* include the following four content areas: general education, biomedical sciences, dental science and dental hygiene science. CODA standards regarding curriculum further break down each of these content areas into subject areas that must be included.

General education content *must* include oral and written communications, psychology and sociology. Biomedical sciences *must* include anatomy, physiology, chemistry, biochemistry, microbiology, immunology, pathology and/or pathophysiology, nutrition and pharmacology. Dental sciences content *must* include tooth morphology, head, neck and oral anatomy, oral embryology and histology, oral pathology, radiography, periodontology, pain management and dental materials. Dental hygiene science *must* include oral health education and counseling, health promotion, patient management, clinical dental hygiene, provision of services for and management of patients with special needs, community dental/oral health, medical and dental emergencies, legal and ethical aspects of dental hygiene practice, infection control and hazard control management, and the provision of oral health care services to patients with bloodborne infectious diseases.

Additionally, CODA standards for clinical instruction specify that first semester preclinical students spend a *minimum* of six hours per week in the clinic. As students begin providing dental hygiene services to patients, they should be scheduled for eight to twelve hours per week in the clinic. During the final prelicensure year, student clinicians are to be scheduled for twelve to sixteen hours per week in the clinic. Didactic instruction on clinical dental hygiene is to be presented throughout the curriculum. (See Appendix II).

B. Faculty

The program is staffed by two full-time faculty members, each of whom meets or exceeds the educational requirements mandated by CODA for teaching an accredited dental hygiene program. The program has a full-time coordinator and a full-time clinical instructor. Additionally, there is a part-time clinical adjunct instructor. (See Appendix III).

C. Students

Dental hygiene students must apply via the Allied Health Application available for the year they're applying. They must apply to take the National League for Nursing (NLN), Pre-RN/Allied Health Entrance Exam and receive a minimum score of 100 which is within a 50% ranking of all students who take the exam. Students are then selected from the highest scores cumulative from the entrance exam, ACT scores, and past academic and professional history.

The Allied Health Application system is point-based. Only applicants scoring at least 100 on the NLN Entrance Exam are considered for the dental hygiene program and are given points based upon ACT scores (if applicable), and other current certifications or college degrees. The ten students with the top scores are then offered a position in the program. (It should be noted that only ten applicants are accepted due to the CODA faculty: student clinic ratio which is 1:5). See Appendix IV for enrollment and graduate data.

Students accepted into the Dental Hygiene program have varying degrees of abilities. Despite meeting the entrance requirements, students complete the program with varying degrees of success depending upon their previous educational or work experience, dedication and effort while in the program, maturity level and self-discipline. Additionally, the Dental Hygiene program is unique in that it requires a very specific fine motor skill set which must be developed over time. It is common to have students excel in the classroom while struggling in the clinic and vice versa. Students are evaluated using the standards of cognitive, affective and psychomotor learning domains through oral, written and hands-on assessment in the classroom, laboratory and clinic.

APPENDIX I

March 4, 2013

Dr. Joanne Tomblin
President
Southern West Virginia Community and Technical College
P O Box 2900
Dempsey Branch Road
Mount Gay, WV 25637

RECEIVED

MAR 18 2013

PRESIDENT'S OFFICE

RE: Dental Hygiene Program

Dear President Tomblin:

At its February 1, 2013 meeting, the Commission on Dental Accreditation considered the June 2012 program change report submitted on behalf of the dental hygiene program sponsored by the Southern West Virginia Community and Technical College. The Commission noted the report proposes a change in program length from 72 to 60 credit hours.

Following careful review of the information provided, the Commission adopted a resolution to continue the program's accreditation status of "approval without reporting requirements" but has postponed action regarding the program changes pending review of further information. Please submit documentation to demonstrate the program will continue to meet the accreditation standards affected by the change. Please submit "before and after" course syllabi and highlight any content that has been removed. An additional evaluation of the program changes will occur at the next regularly scheduled site visit.

The Commission requests one paper copy and one comprehensive electronic copy of the detailed progress report on the implementation of the recommendation(s) be submitted to this office by **May 15, 2013** for consideration at the Dental Hygiene Education Review Committee's meeting and the Commission's July 9-10, 2013 meeting.

Note: The program's documentation for CODA (self-study, application, or reports to CODA, for example) must NOT contain any patient protected health information. If an institution nevertheless provides the Commission and/or Commission site visitors with materials containing patient protected health information (PHI), such materials must be in electronic form and encrypted as outlined by the most recent breach notification regulations related to the Health Insurance Portability and Accountability Act of 1996 (HIPAA).

In addition, most states have enacted laws to protect sensitive personally identifiable information ("PII") such as social security numbers, drivers' license numbers, credit card numbers, account numbers, etc. Before sending documents such as faculty CVs to CODA, institutions must fully redact the following PII: social security numbers, credit or debit card numbers, driver's license numbers or government-issued ID numbers, account numbers, health information, taxpayer ID, and date of birth.

President Tomblin
March 4, 2013
Page 2

In addition to the paper copy requested above, please be advised that the Commission requires that all accreditation correspondence/documents/reports and related materials submitted to the Commission for a program's permanent file be done so electronically. The Electronic Submission Guidelines will assist you in preparing your report. If the program is unable to provide a comprehensive electronic document, the Commission will accept a paper copy and assess a fee to the program for converting the document to an electronic version.

Institutions/Programs are expected to meet established deadlines for submission of requested information. If an institution fails to comply with the Commission's request, it will be assumed that the institution no longer wishes to participate in the accreditation program. In this event, the Commission will immediately notify the chief executive officer of the institution of its *intent to withdraw* the accreditation of the program at its next scheduled meeting.

The Commission has authorized use of the following statement by institutions or programs that wish to announce their programmatic accreditation by the Commission. Programs that wish to advertise the specific programmatic accreditation status granted by the Commission may include that information as indicated in italics below (see text inside square brackets); that portion of the statement is optional but, if used, must be complete and current.

The program in dental hygiene is accredited by the Commission on Dental Accreditation [*and has been granted the accreditation status of "approval without reporting requirements"*]. The Commission is a specialized accrediting body recognized by the United States Department of Education. The Commission on Dental Accreditation can be contacted at (312) 440-4653 or at 211 East Chicago Avenue, Chicago, IL 60611. The Commission's web address is: <http://www.ada.org/100.aspx>.

The staff of the Commission on Dental Accreditation is available for consultation to all educational programs which fall within the Commission's accreditation purview. Educational institutions conducting programs oriented to dentistry are encouraged to obtain such staff counsel and guidance by written or telephone request. Consultation is provided on request prior to, as well as subsequent to, the Commission's granting accreditation to specific programs. The Commission expects to be reimbursed if substantial costs are incurred.

If this office can be of any assistance to you, please contact me at (800) 621-8099, extension 2695 or by email, at renfrowp@ada.org.

President Tomblin
March 4, 2013
Page 3

Sincerely,

Patrice Renfrow

Patrice Renfrow, RDH, BS
Manager, Allied Dental Education
Commission on Dental Accreditation

PR/ap

Sent via e-mail: CODA Accreditation Status Definitions
Reporting Program Changes in Accredited Programs
Electronic Submission of General Correspondence

Link to Evaluation and Operational Policies and Procedures
<http://www.ada.org/314.aspx>

Link to Accreditation Standards for Dental Hygiene Education Programs
<http://www.ada.org/115.aspx>

cc: Ms. Pamela Alderman, dean, Career and Technical Programs
Dr. Lisa Haddox-Heston, program director, Dental Hygiene
Dr. Kent Knoernschild, chair, Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA)
Dr. Anthony J. Ziebert, senior vice president, Education/Professional Affairs, ADA
Dr. Sherin Tooks, director, Commission on Dental Accreditation (CODA)
United States Department of Education
State Boards of Dentistry
Institutional Accreditors

*cc: Dr. Harry Langley, VP Academic Affairs and Student Services
Ms Alyce Patterson-Diaz, Chair, Dept. of Allied Health and Nursing*

APPENDIX II

APPENDIX II

Dental Hygiene Curriculum (2012-2014 Program)

<u>General Education Courses:</u>		<u>Credits</u>
AH 203 Communications for the Health Care Professional	1	
CS 103 Introduction to Applications		1
EN 101 English Composition		3
PY 201 General Psychology		3
SO 200 Introduction to Sociology	3	
 <u>Support Courses:</u>		
BS 118 Essentials of Human Systems (formerly AH 145 w/ lab)		4
CH 203 Fundamentals of General, Organic, and Biological Chemistry		4
 <u>Major Courses:</u>		
DH 100 Head and Neck Anatomy	2	
DH 101 Dental Anatomy, Histology & Embryology		3
DH 102 Introduction to Dental Hygiene (Pre-clinic Lecture and Clinic)		3
DH 103 Dental Radiology (Lecture and Lab)		2
DH 104 General and Oral Pathology		2
DH 105 Pharmacology for Dental Hygiene	2	
DH 106 Clinic I (Lecture & Clinic)	4	
DH 107 Essentials of Nutrition for Dental Hygiene	1	
DH 207 Dental Materials	1	
DH 212 Clinic II (Lecture & Clinic)	6	
DH 213 Anesthesiology (Lecture & Lab)	2	
DH 216 Clinic III (Lecture & Clinic)		6
DH 219 Dental Hygiene Seminar (Capstone)		4
DH 220 Periodontology	2	
DH 221 Community Dentistry		1
	60 Total	

Note: General education requirements for this program do not include a math course as mathematical

principles are taught throughout the curriculum in DH 102, DH 103, DH 105, DH 106, DH 212, DH 213 and DH 219.

In major-specific courses, the credit: lab ratio is 1:3 hours. The credit: clinic ratio is 1:4 hours. This is necessary to meet the standards dictated by the Commission on Dental Accreditation.

APPENDIX III

**APPENDIX III
Faculty Data**

Name: Lisa Jan Haddox-Heston, BSDH, DDS **Rank:** Program Coordinator,
Assistant Professor

Check One: Full-time X Part-time ___ Adjunct ___ Graduate Asst. ___

Highest Degree Earned: DDS **Date Degree Received:** March 12, 1988

Conferred by: West Virginia University

Area of Specialization: Dentistry

Professional licensure: 24 years

Years of employment at present institution: 9

Years of employment in higher education: 9

Years of related experience outside higher education: 25

Non-teaching experience: 25

To determine compatibility of credentials with this assignment:

(a) List courses you taught this year and those you taught last year. For each course, include year and semester taught, course number, title and enrollment.

<u>Year/Semester</u>	<u>Course Number and Title</u>	<u>Enrollment</u>
Fall 2012	DH 101 Dental Anatomy, Histology and Embryology	10
	DH 102 Introduction to Dental Hygiene (CLINIC)	10
Spring 2013	DH 104 General and Oral Pathology	10
	DH 105 Pharmacology	10
	DH 106 Clinic I (CLINIC only)	10
Fall 2013	DH 213 Anesthesiology (Lecture and Lab)	10
	DH 212 Clinic II (CLINIC only)	10
Spring 2014	DH 207 Dental Materials (Lecture and Lab)	10
	DH 219 Dental Hygiene Seminar (Board Review)	10

(b) If degree is not in area of current assignment, explain. N/A

(c) Identify your professional development activities during the past five years.
35 continuing education credit hours are required every other year to maintain licensure by the West Virginia Board of Dental Examiners.

**APPENDIX III
Faculty Data**

Name: Andrea Brown, BS, RDH **Rank:** Assistant Professor

Check One: Full-time X Part-time ___ Adjunct ___ Graduate Asst. ___

Highest Degree Earned: BS **Date Degree Received:** May 05, 1998

Conferred by: Mountain State University

Area of Specialization: Organizational Leadership (A.S. in Dental Hygiene from West Liberty)

Professional licensure: 14 years

Years of employment at present institution: 8

Years of employment in higher education: 8

Years of related experience outside higher education: 14

Non-teaching experience: 06

To determine compatibility of credentials with this assignment:

(a) List courses you taught this year and those you taught last year. For each course, include year and semester taught, course number, title and enrollment.

<u>Year/Semester</u>	<u>Course Number and Title</u>	<u>Enrollment</u>
Fall 2012	DH 100 Head & Neck Anatomy	10
	DH 102 Introduction to Dental Hygiene (CLINIC & LEC)	10
Spring 2013	DH 103 Radiology Lecture & Lab	10
	DH 107 Essentials of Nutrition for Dental Hygiene	10
	DH 106 Clinic I (CLINIC & LEC)	10
Fall 2013	DH 220 Periodontology	10
	DH 221 Community Dentistry	10
	DH 212 Clinic II (CLINIC & LEC)	10
Spring 2014	DH 216 Clinic III (CLINIC & LEC)	10

(b) If degree is not in area of current assignment, explain. N/A

(c) Identify your professional development activities during the past five years.

20 continuing education credit hours are required every other year to maintain licensure by the West Virginia Board of Dental Examiners.

APPENDIX IV

**APPENDIX IV
Enrollment/Graduate Data**

Class of 2009	
Applicants	270
Enrollment	12
Graduates	7

Class of 2010	
Applicants	208
Enrollment	12
Graduates	11

NOTE: Effective 2009, CODA changed the faculty:student clinic ratio to 1:5, therefore only ten students were accepted into future classes. Additionally, the program adopted an every other year admission policy due to CODA requirements and number of faculty.

Class of 2012	
Applicants	158
Enrollment	10
Graduates	10

Class of 2014	
Applicants	136
Enrollment	10
Graduates	To be determined in May of 2014